

RECEIVED JUN 29 1989

Sarah Miller



UNIVERSITY AT BUFFALO
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

Great Lakes Program
207 Jarvis Hall
Buffalo, New York 14260
(716) 636-2088

June 16, 1989

Ralph R. Rumer
Director

R. Warren Flint
Associate Director

TO: Jack Vallentyne, Barry Boyer, Ineke Neutel, John Vena,
Jim Blascovich, and Phil Weller

FROM: Warren Flint *PLF*

Re: Minutes of the June 9th Coordinating Committee Meeting

Enclosed are the minutes of the June 9, 1989 Coordinating Committee meeting held in Buffalo. For your information, I have also sent a copy of these minutes to each April Workshop group facilitator because there are discussions recorded in the minutes that contain information pertinent to their needs in completing the work group reports.

Please pay particular attention to the highlighted areas of the minutes because there are specific items that require your attention in the form of recommendations to me regarding Conference Speakers, etc.

Also please note the date of the next Coordinating Committee meeting. We have set this meeting for AUGUST 2, 1989 AT CCIW IN BURLINGTON, ONTARIO. I will be sending you an agenda for this meeting in the next several weeks.

You will soon be receiving the revised description of the delegate selection process from Ineke Neutel. In addition, I will soon be mailing the list of questions for your priority ranking that we will use to guide the formation of ISSUE GROUPS for the October Conference. Please respond to these two communications as soon as you receive them.

If there are any problems with the minutes that are enclosed here, please contact me. I Look forward to seeing you in August.

cc: Disciplinary Workshop Group Facilitators

RWF3.8/COORDCOM.mem

**EVALUATING RISKS TO HUMAN HEALTH ASSOCIATED WITH EXPOSURE TO
TOXIC CHEMICALS IN THE GREAT LAKES BASIN ECOSYSTEM**

FULL CIRCLE

INTERNATIONAL WORKING CONFERENCE COMMITTEE MEETING

June 9, 1989
9:00 AM to 3:30 PM
414 BONNER HALL
SUNY at Buffalo, Amherst Campus

MEETING MINUTES

In Attendance: Jack Vallentyne - Chair, Barry Boyer, Jim Blascovich, Ineke Neutel, John Vena, Phil Weller

The following April Workshop Group Facilitators attended the meeting starting at 11:00 AM: Jim Gillett, Adeline Levine, Ann McElroy, Bill Rish, Jim Olson, Arnold Schecter, Andy Gilman, and Jay Van Oostdam

1. Meeting called to order at 9:15 AM by Chairman Vallentyne. Approval of the minutes from the April 17th meeting of Coordinating Committee in Niagara-on-the-Lake.
2. Warren Flint reported that Beth Jones-Fiore has resigned from the Coordinating Committee because of additional responsibilities in the Wisconsin Division of Health. Her resignation is effective after she completes her duties regarding the Policy Work Group Report from the April Workshop.
3. Committee discussion regarding whether we continue with the project. Everyone agreed that enough momentum had developed following the Disciplinary Workshop in April to guarantee success of the project in completing stated goals. Therefore, there was a consensus to continue with the project through at least the Fall Working Conference.
4. Projected time-line for project activities was presented to the Committee by Warren Flint. There were no changes in this time-line as presented.
5. The Coordinating Committee, Subcommittee structure and definition to accomplish specific tasks was discussed. The following Subcommittee definition was decided upon with indicated leadership.
 - A. ISSUES SUBCOMMITTEE: consists of the Work Group Facilitators and the entire Coordinating Committee. Will meet during the summer of 1989 to evaluate the issues identified by the Disciplinary Workshop Groups in their reports.

- B. PARTICIPANTS SUBCOMMITTEE: This subcommittee will define the participants for the International Working Conference via application for nomination and delegate selection. Drs. Ineke Neutel and Jim Blascovich will head this subcommittee with participation from Dr. Warren Flint and Phil Weller (Great Lakes United).
- C. LOCAL ARRANGEMENTS SUBCOMMITTEE: This subcommittee will plan and arrange for all Conference logistics. Dr. Warren Flint will head this subcommittee.
- D. PUBLICATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE: This subcommittee will synthesize the reports of April Disciplinary Workshop into a Briefing Book for the International Working Conference. This subcommittee will also synthesize the results and edit the task group reports of the October 1989 International Working Conference and incorporate these into publication formats that will include an immediate *Executive Summary*, a *Conference Proceedings*, and *Journal Publication* of selected papers. The Executive Summary will be prepared for immediate dissemination of Conference conclusions and recommendations to governments and the public in both Canada and the U.S. Dr. John Vena will head this subcommittee, with participation from Drs. Paul Kostyniak and Warren Flint.
- E. PUBLIC INFORMATION & POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE: This subcommittee will follow through with dissemination of the International Working Conference results and recommendations to the general public and policy makers. Their role will include continuing the conference process via audio-visual teleconferencing that would allow for two-way dialogue between the experts and the publics throughout the Great Lakes Basin on the issues evaluated. Barry Boyer will head this subcommittee with participation from Warren Flint.
6. The format for the Briefing Book for the Fall Conference was discussed. It was decided that the document should contain a mildly-edited version of the eight work group reports with an integrated summary (executive summary) preceding the reports that captures the highlights of each individual report. Preceding this executive summary will be a brief description of the Working Conference process (i.e., task group and issue group dynamics). Following the work group reports will be a chapter that defines the task groups, lists the questions to be considered by the issue groups, and presents the charge for the conference delegates. It was also decided that, if possible, Great Lakes United would contribute a chapter to be included as a work group report that covers the subject of public perception on the issue of Great Lakes toxic chemicals and human health. Warren Flint further reported that because of the uniqueness of the Briefing Book (i.e., a collection of all discipline perspectives under one cover) a publisher was going to be sought to publish this book after final editing. There was agreement expressed for this by all committee members and Wiley, Springer-Verlag, and John Wiley & Sons were some potential publishers that will be approached. An outline for the Briefing Book is listed below:
- I. Description of the project rationale and the Fall Conference Process.

- II. Integrated Summary of Work Group Report Chapters.
- III. Work Group Report Chapters - mildly edited in consistent format. This would include a Public Perception Chapter from Great Lakes United.
- IV. Summary of Issues of Difference between the discipline groups for resolution at the Fall Conference. This section would also include the list of Task Groups and Issue Groups and their specific charges for the Fall Conference.

7. Warren Flint reported on the funding that was contributed to support the April Disciplinary Workshop. This funding assessment did not necessarily include in-kind services for peoples time. Most of the funds contributed have now been used to cover the April workshop. A breakdown of funds and their sources is listed below:

Fisheries & Oceans Canada	\$ 5,000
Health & Welfare Canada	\$10,000
Environment Canada	\$ 3,000
Great Lakes Prog., SUNY Buffalo	\$13,200
BASAH, SUNY Buffalo	\$ 800
Toxicology Res. Center, SUNY Buffalo	\$ 200
NY Great Lakes Research Consortium	\$ 2,000
Can./Amer. Stud. Program, SUNY Buffalo	\$ 2,000
Conf. in the Disciplines Prog., SUNY Buffalo	\$ 2,000
SANDOZ Corporation	\$ 5,000

TOTAL	\$43,200
--------------	----------

8. Warren Flint reported on efforts to attract additional funds for support of the October International Working Conference. Seven formal proposals have been submitted to agencies and foundations and an additional five initial inquiries have been made of other potential funding sources. The UB Foundation at SUNY Buffalo has also been contacted to aid in the process of attracting local industry, insurance company and banking interest and funding to the project.
9. Warren Flint reported that arrangements have been made for the Conference site. The October International Working Conference will be held at the Hyatt Regency in downtown Buffalo. Sixteen small rooms have been reserved for the task and issue group meetings and one large conference room has been reserved for the opening and closing plenary sessions. A block of 60 sleeping rooms was also reserved for Conference delegates. Based upon concerns expressed by a number of Committee members, the Conference dates have been changed from October 3-6, 1989 to September 30-October 3, 1989. This change will relieve some of the pressure that academic people might

feel in attending the conference totally during the week and missing teaching responsibilities.

10. Warren Flint indicated that he needed recommendations for keynote speakers for the plenary sessions of the Conference. Suggestions by Committee members included the Honorable Lucien Bouchard, Minister of the Environment for Canada, U.S. Senator Jack Kennedy who chairs the Health Committee in the U.S. Senate, Mr. William Reilly, U.S. E.P.A. Administrator, Mr. Victor Goldblum, a Canadian politician, and Dr. David Axelrod, New York Commissioner, Department of Health. Recommendations regarding potential keynote speakers should be submitted by other committee members to Warren Flint by July 1, 1989.
11. Jim Blascovich reported on the actual design of the October International Working Conference. He defined the role of the TASK GROUPS and the ISSUE GROUPS and illustrated how they would interact during the conference. The issue of how to address the first question raised in the "Conference Design" document, ARE THERE THREATS TO HUMAN HEALTH FROM TOXIC CHEMICALS IN THE GREAT LAKES BASIN ECOSYSTEM, AND IF SO WHAT ARE THEY, was discussed extensively by committee members. It was decided to try and deal with this question in the executive summary of the Briefing Book and to also have it addressed by a thought-provoking presentation during the opening plenary session. RECOMMENDATIONS ARE NEEDED FROM THE COMMITTEE ON A PERSON TO MAKE THIS PRESENTATION. The Coordinating Committee also needs to decide how we will develop the answer to this question for presentation in the Briefing Book, based upon results of the April Disciplinary Workshop.
12. With the lead of Jim Blascovich, the committee identified the Task Groups and defined their scope of activity. Six groups were defined under the three general categories of Education, Policy, and Research. These Task Groups included under education, technical (professional training) and non-technical (general and public), under policy, regulation and incentives, and under research, problem characterization and problem management. These specific Task Groups were defined as follows:

TECHNICAL EDUCATION - what training is required to prepare professionals to better deal with the complex interdisciplinary problems associated with environmental toxic chemicals and human health exposure?

NON-TECHNICAL EDUCATION - what approaches are needed to guarantee appropriate dissemination of scientific information to governments and the public and what methods are needed to increase public awareness of the issues and possible solutions?

POLICY REGULATION - what techniques are needed for modifying risk-creating behavior through coercive means such as performance standards backed by penalties, permits, licenses, or impact statements?

POLICY INCENTIVES - what techniques are needed for modifying risk-creating behavior through indirect means that alter key actor's

motivations or "payoffs" for certain kinds of behavior, or through provision of compensation for harm? Incentives may be positive (e.g., grants or subsidies for pollution control) or negative (e.g., pollution fees or taxes). They may operate prospectively, or after toxic pollution has occurred (as most liability systems do).

PROBLEM CHARACTERIZATION RESEARCH - by making use of data on types of chemicals, transportation, exposure (via source, pathway, route), dose, and effects in individuals and populations and by employing assumptions, theories, models, and scientific judgement, how do we: (1) determine what and where the problems are/were and (2) when and how the problems occur/occurred?

PROBLEM MANAGEMENT RESEARCH - by making use of problem characteristics, risk estimation, and technical capability and by considering societal values, economic burden, and scientific judgement, how do we: (1) resolve/remediate problems and (2) develop strategies toward preventing/mitigating problems?

13. Committee members agreed that the Work Group Reports from the April Disciplinary Workshop should be submitted to Warren Flint's office by June 30, 1989 along with a diskette that contains the report text for integrating into the Briefing Book in a consistent format. Warren Flint indicated that he would communicate this as a reminder to each group facilitator following the Coordinating Committee meeting.
14. Jim Blascovich suggested to the committee that after the conference delegates have been selected and the TASK GROUP facilitators chosen, that these Fall Conference facilitators should be brought together and briefed on the process and overall intent of the Working Conference. This will guarantee that they are adequately prepared to lead their groups to productive results and expected products.
15. The April Workshop group facilitators and the coordinating committee members discussed the list of questions that would be used to define the ISSUE GROUPS for the Fall Conference. A total of 26 questions were listed and it was decided that these would be integrated by Warren Flint and distributed to both coordinating committee members and group facilitators for priority ranking. Following receipt of the priority ranking from everybody, the Coordinating Committee will develop the final list of questions that will be used to define the specific ISSUE GROUPS.
16. Ineke Neutel reported on progress for development of selection criteria for the delegates that will attend the October Conference. She has developed a matrix that will be modified to include categories for both the institution/organization that a delegate represents as well as discipline that a delegate represents. Dr. Neutel will have a revised version of this matrix, with inclusion of all institutions and disciplines ready for mailing to all work group facilitators and coordinating committee members by early July. The questions that will be asked regarding this model to all reviewers will be: (1) are disciplines adequately represented,

(2) are institutions adequately represented, and (3) do you agree with the matrix selection model? Ineke will integrate comments from the facilitators and committee members for the next meeting of the Coordinating Committee.

17. Barry Boyer reported to the committee on the results of discussions regarding public participation following the October International Working Conference. Barry passed out several documents that briefed the committee on these activities. A grant proposal is in preparation for submittal to the Gannett Foundation for partial funding of this process. Discussions have been conducted with a documentary film producer and a person that conducts tele-conferences, in order to investigate the possibility of using this technology for public dissemination/participation. Barry was instructed by the committee to move forward with these activities and the committee acknowledged that these activities would be supported by the committee through the conduct of the October conference, but beyond this point public participation would have a life of its own.
18. The committee discussed the possibility of inviting Great Lakes United to become an active member of the Coordinating Committee through representation by Phillip Weller, the Executive Director of Great Lakes United. There was agreement that this should happen and that Mr. Weller would serve on the Coordinating Committee as well as the Delegate Selection subcommittee. Warren Flint was asked to send a formal letter to Mr. Weller inviting him to become a member.
19. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE COORDINATING COMMITTEE WAS SET FOR WEDNESDAY AUGUST 2, 1989 AT CCIW IN BURLINGTON ONTARIO.
20. The Coordinating Committee adjourned at 3:45 PM

Respectfully Submitted,

R. Warren Flint